

**Table S1:** Summary of three-factor mixed model ANOVAs comparing the removal rates of (a) *Sargassum cf. baccularia* and (b) *S. polycystum* among three sites within each of three bays on Orpheus Island. Analyses were based on individual *Sargassum* thalli transplanted within each site. The proportion of biomass removed was arcsine-squareroot transformed. Significant effects ( $p < 0.05$ ) are given in bold.

A) *Sargassum cf. baccularia*

Source of variation	SS	df	MS	F	p
<b>Bay</b>	<b>4.6698</b>	2	<b>2.3349</b>	<b>18.8830</b>	<b>0.0026</b>
Day	0.2308	2	0.1154	1.6674	0.2296
Site(Bay)	0.7419	6	0.1237	1.7869	0.1846
Bay $\times$ Day	0.5134	4	0.1283	1.8546	0.1833
<b>Day <math>\times</math> Site(Bay)</b>	<b>0.8304</b>	<b>12</b>	<b>0.0692</b>	<b>3.1851</b>	<b>0.0017</b>
Residual	1.1732	54	0.0217		

B) *Sargassum polycystum*

<b>Bay</b>	<b>2.4342</b>	2	<b>1.2171</b>	<b>19.7660</b>	<b>0.0023</b>
Day	0.0092	2	0.0046	0.0848	0.9192
Site(Bay)	0.2139	4	0.0535	0.9891	0.4501
Bay $\times$ Day	0.3695	6	0.0616	1.1390	0.3975
<b>Day <math>\times</math> Site(Bay)</b>	<b>0.6487</b>	<b>12</b>	<b>0.0541</b>	<b>2.8911</b>	<b>0.0038</b>
Residual	1.0098	54	0.0187		

**Table S2:** Relationship between benthic composition and the herbivorous fish community at nine reef crest sites on Orpheus Island. Benthic categories were based on six transects and fish densities were based on three transects within each site. Pearson's correlation coefficients are given, and the associated probabilities are shown in parentheses. Significant correlations ( $p < 0.05$ ) are shown in bold.

	Dimension 1 (nMDS)	Dimension 2 (nMDS)	<i>Siganus</i> <i>doliatus</i>	<i>Siganus</i> <i>rivulatus</i>	<i>Chlorurus</i> <i>microrhinos</i>	<i>Scarus</i> <i>flavipinnatus</i>	<i>Acanthurus</i> spp.	<i>Naso</i> <i>unicornis</i>	<i>Pomacanthus</i> spp.	<i>Scarus</i> spp.	<i>Siganus</i> spp.	'other'
Dimension 1 (nMDS)	0.484 (0.187)	-0.388 (0.302)	<b>0.668</b> <b>(0.049)</b>	0.459 (0.214)	0.089 (0.821)	-0.456 (0.218)	0.462 (0.211)	0.340 (0.371)	-0.632 (0.068)	-0.200 (0.606)	-0.468 (0.203)	0.356 (0.348)
Dimension 2 (nMDS)	-0.090 (0.818)	0.282 (0.462)	-0.396 (0.292)	-0.338 (0.373)	-0.518 (0.153)	-0.200 (0.605)	-0.017 (0.965)	-0.105 (0.788)	0.317 (0.405)	-0.312 (0.411)	-0.091 (0.816)	0.390 (0.300)
Live branching coral	0.295 (0.441)	-0.318 (0.404)	0.181 (0.641)	0.429 (0.249)	0.354 (0.349)	0.507 (0.163)	0.432 (0.246)	-0.084 (0.830)	-0.188 (0.629)	<b>0.876</b> <b>(0.002)</b>	0.024 (0.951)	0.104 (0.790)
Live massive coral	0.738 (0.023)	0.091 (0.817)	0.555 (0.121)	-0.018 (0.963)	0.007 (0.986)	-0.187 (0.630)	0.088 (0.822)	0.480 (0.191)	-0.626 (0.071)	0.115 (0.768)	-0.283 (0.461)	0.378 (0.316)
Dead branching coral	-0.13 (0.738)	-0.377 (0.317)	0.124 (0.750)	0.478 (0.193)	-0.305 (0.425)	-0.540 (0.133)	0.367 (0.331)	0.181 (0.642)	-0.160 (0.681)	-0.480 (0.191)	-0.525 (0.147)	0.029 (0.941)
Dead massive coral	0.441 (0.235)	0.213 (0.582)	0.287 (0.454)	-0.067 (0.864)	-0.270 (0.482)	0.121 (0.756)	0.233 (0.547)	0.281 (0.463)	-0.133 (0.733)	-0.110 (0.779)	0.177 (0.648)	0.224 (0.563)
Live plate coral	0.273 (0.476)	-0.600 (0.088)	<b>0.754</b> <b>(0.019)</b>	0.516 (0.155)	0.583 (0.099)	-0.387 (0.304)	0.559 (0.118)	-0.326 (0.392)	-0.514 (0.157)	0.072 (0.854)	-0.330 (0.385)	0.092 (0.813)
Dead plate coral	0.158 (0.686)	-0.062 (0.873)	-0.080 (0.838)	-0.016 (0.968)	0.165 (0.672)	-0.417 (0.264)	-0.149 (0.701)	-0.020 (0.959)	-0.436 (0.241)	0.152 (0.696)	-0.382 (0.310)	0.453 (0.221)
Live encrusting coral	-0.158	0.552	-0.297	-0.584	<b>-0.699</b>	0.059	-0.211	0.071	0.625	-0.464	0.129	-0.145

(0.686) (0.123) (0.438) (0.099) **(0.036)** (0.880) (0.585) (0.856) (0.072) (0.208) (0.740) (0.709)

Soft coral	-0.187 (0.630)	0.333 (0.381)	-0.471 (0.201)	-0.483 (0.188)	0.073 (0.852)	0.313 (0.412)	-0.261 (0.498)	-0.564 (0.114)	0.419 (0.262)	0.405 (0.280)	0.318 (0.404)	0.016 (0.968)
Macroalgae	0.243 (0.529)	-0.519 (0.153)	0.666 (0.050)	0.530 (0.143)	0.182 (0.640)	-0.630 (0.069)	0.448 (0.226)	0.194 (0.618)	-0.566 (0.112)	-0.498 (0.172)	-0.437 (0.240)	0.229 (0.554)
Rubble	<b>-0.709</b> <b>(0.033)</b>	0.125 (0.748)	-0.579 (0.103)	-0.155 (0.690)	-0.050 (0.898)	0.267 (0.487)	-0.404 (0.281)	-0.243 (0.529)	0.574 (0.106)	-0.082 (0.833)	0.349 (0.357)	-0.612 (0.080)
Sand	0.537 (0.136)	-0.398 (0.288)	0.650 (0.058)	0.394 (0.295)	0.299 (0.435)	-0.414 (0.268)	0.218 (0.573)	0.461 (0.212)	<b>-0.737</b> <b>(0.024)</b>	0.049 (0.900)	-0.602 (0.086)	0.355 (0.348)